Comments on Nsamba Final Paper

Reviewed by: Morgan Muell

Introduction:

* When you do an in-text citation, only use the author’s last name, not their first name, and don’t use any commas, ex. (Rees et al. 2014)
* I would phrase the first sentence of the second paragraph as “Beta-tubulin is important because of its role in drug action etc. etc.” instead of saying it is important because of what the literature focuses on. Say it is important because of its function, and then cite the literature that has done studies on that
* You did a great job providing background information and motivating your study!
* Instead of using bullet points under “the proposal is set to” heading, I would just write one more paragraph to end the introduction
  + Great laying out of the goals of the project though!
* Why use neighbor-joining for determining selection pressure instead of maximum likelihood or Bayesian methods? Just curious, as ML and Bayesian seem to be more progressive methods.

Methods:

* Instead of opening the paragraph with “sources of data:” I would phrase it as a sentence.
* Make sure to write your methods section in the past tense (i.e. “We used this protein sequence” instead of “We will use this protein sequence” etc.).
* Write FASTA in all capital letters; same for NEXUS and PHYLIP
* Make sure the font is sized so that “Methods” the biggest setting, and Phylogenetic Analyses and all other subheadings are smaller than Methods

Results and Discussion:

* The first paragraph in your results document looks to me more like a combination of the beginning of a discussion section and a bit of methods. I would parse out this section of the document into “Results” and “Discussion” instead of morphing them together.
* No need to redefine omega in the second sentence of the second paragraph; just make sure you do it somewhere in the introduction
* Make sure to always cite Tables and Figures within parantheses
* When you mention Ohta’s hypothesis in the first sentence of the third paragraph, be sure to cite the paper that introduced Ohta’s hypothesis.
* I would avoid contractions in scientific writing (i.e. use “has not” instead of “hasn’t”)
* I am a bit confused by the purpose of the third column in tables 2 and 3. I don’t think it is pertinent information to include the column on “Class: Approved Name.”
* Be sure to always cite tables and figures at the end of sentences, not mid-sentence.
* Cool results!
* I think you could expand on how maximum likelihood and neighbor-joining produces conflicting topologies. It’s interesting, and I bet Dr. Lavrov would love to see you demonstrate your knowledge on why they might differ.
* Your phylogenetic trees and captions for them look very professional. Well done!
* I like your overall conclusions

Be sure to combine your references into one large reference section the end of everything.